



*review 2*

reviewer: eva marsal

## a response to ecclestone and hayes' critique of therapeutic education using the community of inquiry to bridge the divide between the therapeutic and the educational

### authors

**ali greenwellhall**

school of education, bath spa university, england

email: ali.greenwellhall22@bathspa.ac.uk

<https://orcid.org/0009-0004-3252-7971>

**darren garside**

school of education, bath spa university, england

email: darren.garside.real@icloud.com

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0076-9122>

### how to quote this article:

**APA:** Greenwellhall, A., & Garside, D. (2025). A response to ecclestone and hayes' critique of therapeutic education using the community of inquiry to bridge the divide between the therapeutic and the educational. *childhood & philosophy*, 21, 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.12957/childphilo.2025.88785>.

**ABNT:** GREENWELLHALL, Ali; GARSIDE, Darren. A response to ecclestone and hayes' critique of therapeutic education using the community of inquiry to bridge the divide between the therapeutic and the educational. *childhood & philosophy*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 21, p. 1-15, 2025. Disponível em: [inserir link]. Acesso em: [inserir data de acesso].



This article is very interesting and highly recommended, but there are a few points that need to be highlighted.

The starting point for the article is a published derogatory remark about the P4C research strategy for children. The aim was therefore to present this movement and its possibilities clearly, to distinguish it from other movements and to show the similarities and differences with therapeutic group work. This was achieved very well. The same applies to the constructive treatment of the arguments of Ecclestone and Hayes etc.

However, the following points need to be addressed more fully:

- The central concept of "therapeutic education", which the author deals with in relation to P4C, must be introduced. It is taken as a basis without being defined. It is therefore unclear which points are affected, who uses it and whether there are any scientific studies on it.

- The concept of PwC is well differentiated from the clinical strategy of 'child and adolescent therapy', for example by this quote: "This respectful, openminded environment then is not a distinguishing factor, but a requirement of each. It is through the dispositional capacities and awarenesses that underpin critical analysis and subsequent evaluation of the most meaningful propositions, and the making of informed judgements, especially those with normative intentions, that we can distinguish the practices of philosophizing with children from therapeutic groupwork as being a difference of type.

But perhaps it should also be briefly emphasised that there is a real justification for therapeutic group work because traumatised children or children with social or psychological problems need clinical treatment. This is independent of the criticism of the concept of "therapeutic education".

PwC's description of the development and unfolding of the self is very good, e.g. p.4. In addition, PwC's community of inquiry pedagogy provides the conditions for selves to engage in the intellectual work of inquiry, while also supporting what Ann Sharp calls 'self-correction', a concept she develops from Charles Peirce (Sharp, 2018), and which contributes to what we call selves-in-transition.

It should perhaps be briefly added here that the PwC's view of the child is not based on the concept of 'the diminished self', quite the opposite.

Therefore, it does not make sense to extend the concept of 'the diminished self' It would be better “in contrast to `Returning to the concept of the diminished self, as described by Ecclestone & Hayes, we propose [ .....] the self as transitioning during its educational lifetime, from less to more mature, from interdependence towards greater independence. S. 6.

6: However, our proposal is that an integrated, transitioning self makes no cognitive and affective distinction in the moment, when experiencing achievement.

This sentence should be expanded, because in philosophy it is important to distinguish between feeling and understanding: Hume: the emotions are the wind that fills the sails and keeps the ship sailing (motivation), the mind is the helm. Despite all the joy of success, one should reflect on the conditions that led to this success.

- 6/7 “claims that past life experiences have long-term negative emotional effects for everyone, and particularly pernicious effects for an increasing minority” (Ecclestone & Hayes, 2009). Indicate page number of citation.
- 7 “central nucleus of a truly transformative education” (García Moriyón, 2019), indicate page number of citation.

#### **on the structure:**

Subheadings should improve the readability of the article. The reader will then also know better which point/argument is being discussed in this section.